

Biogeosciences Discuss., referee comment RC5
<https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-135-RC5>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Reply on RC4

Axel Kleidon (Referee)

Referee comment on "Comment on K. Michaelian and A. Simeonov (2015) "Fundamental molecules of life are pigments which arose and co-evolved as a response to the thermodynamic imperative of dissipating the prevailing solar spectrum"" by Lars Olof Björn, Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-135-RC5>, 2021

There are two issues involved here:

1. Is the claim by Michaelian & Simeonov (2015) valid or useful? Here I side with the skeptical attitude of the author of the commentary and with William Martin. I do not believe MS2015, and doubt that it has much value. So there would be quite a bit that can be criticized, but this criticism in its own needs to be well justified and substantiated.
2. Is the commentary by Björn well justified and substantiated? As I expressed in my review, it is not. For a commentary, I would expect something stronger and better argued, and I gave an example of how such a commentary could look like in the review. In the case of MS2015, I think that such a more substantial commentary would be easy to do.

Because of (2.), I recommend rejection of this comment.