# Comment on angeo-2021-41

Anonymous Referee #2

---

Referee comment on "Estimation of date and magnitude of four major earthquakes using integration of precursors obtained from remote sensing data" by Mohammad Mahdi Khoshgoftar and Mohammad Reza Saradjian, Ann. Geophys. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/angeo-2021-41-RC2, 2021

---

The manuscript titled 'Estimation of date and magnitude of four major earthquakes using integration of precursors obtained from remote sensing data' by Khoshgoftar et al., is an interesting study dealing with the detection of earthquake precursors. This is a well-written study with the use of a large number of various data sets. However, I have serious reservations on the results and I list my objections below in the form of major comments:

1. As this study deals with anomalies and the authors have made major use of TEC anomalies in their study, I do not find mention of TEC uncertainties anywhere in this manuscript. The authors mention that they have used TEC GIMs for earthquake precursor detection but the uncertainty levels have not been mentioned. As the TEC uncertainties in GIMs except over North America and Europe generally exceed 3 TECu and the authors are dealing with this level of DTEC, it is difficult to ascertain whether the TEC anomalies are genuine or just random noise.

2. The same goes for other datasets and their uncertainty levels. Unless this is clarified, it is difficult to make valid judgement about the results. I'd request the authors to make appropriate changes in the manuscript based on these comments.
I recommend a major revision for this manuscript purely because it is difficult to take a correct call on the shown results and the efficacy of the methods that are mentioned.