

Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., community comment CC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2021-830-CC2>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on acp-2021-830

Alexey Kiselev

Community comment on "Time dependence of heterogeneous ice nucleation by ambient aerosols: laboratory observations and a formulation for models" by Jonas K. F. Jakobsson et al., Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2021-830-CC2>, 2022

Dr. Gabor Vali has very recently attracted my attention to the excellent experimental data set on isothermal freezing of droplets containing ambient INPs, presented in the manuscript by Jonas Jakobsson, Vaughan Phillips, and Thomas Bjerring-Kristensen. I have read it with great interest. I fully agree with the authors that the isothermal freezing experiments are scarce and the data sets containing such experimental data are valuable. For this reason, I would like to draw the authors' attention to the manuscript we have published in 2016, where we have investigated the freezing behavior of several feldspar specimens in immersion freezing in a droplet freezing assay setup (Peckhaus et al., ACP 2016). Owing to the large number of droplets in our droplet freezing assay setup, we could observe freezing of several hundreds of nL-sized droplets at constant temperature for an hour. Our observations have, in general, confirmed the conclusions of this manuscript: in a simple system containing only one type of ice nucleating active site, the freezing follows a strict exponential pattern, whereas in a heterogeneous system featuring broad or even multimodal distribution of IN active sites, a steady decrease of freezing rate over time is observed. Interestingly, we could account for all observed effects (time dilation of freezing rate, freezing behavior at constant cooling rate, and cooling rate dependency) by using a consistent set of fit parameters within a CNT-based model equation framework (the so-called Soccer-Ball Model, SBM, Niedermeier et al., 2014 and 2015). Given the size of our sample and relatively high level of control over the experimental conditions, the authors of this manuscript might be interested in applying their parameterization to our experimental data set, which we will be happy to share. In any case, a mention of the (Peckhaus et al., 2016) in the introduction would make the overview of the previous research more complete.

With best regards,

Alexei A. Kiselev

Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany

Peckhaus, A., Kiselev, A., Hiron, T., Ebert, M., and Leisner, T.: A comparative study of K-rich and Na/Ca-rich feldspar ice-nucleating particles in a nanoliter droplet freezing assay,

Atmos. Chem. Phys., 16, 11477-11496, 10.5194/acp-16-11477-2016, 2016.

Niedermeier, D., Augustin-Bauditz, S., Hartmann, S., Wex, H., Ignatius, K., and Stratmann, F.: Can we define an asymptotic value for the ice active surface site density for heterogeneous ice nucleation?, *J. Geo. Res. A.*, n/a-n/a, 10.1002/2014jd022814, 2015.

Niedermeier, D., Ervens, B., Clauss, T., Voigtländer, J., Wex, H., Hartmann, S., and Stratmann, F.: A computationally efficient description of heterogeneous freezing: A simplified version of the Soccer ball model, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41, 736-741, 10.1002/2013gl058684, 2014.