

## ***Interactive comment on “The CAMELS data set: catchment attributes and meteorology for large-sample studies” by Nans Addor et al.***

### **Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 4 May 2017

This manuscript presents a nice extension of Newman et al., 2015b on a catchment dataset across the U.S. My group have used the Newman dataset in our research new process understanding, so I am happy to see the extension of it. I feel this manuscript can be published at HESS after addressing the following comments.

1. MOPEX dataset is a very good example of such a catchment dataset. It has been extensively used by the hydrology and land surface modeling communities leading to at least over 100 journal articles. It'd be interesting to see a more in-depth or more detailed comparison between MOPEX and the new dataset here, i.e., a table would be nice.
2. I'd like to see more (perhaps quantitative) discussion on whether and how the catchments included in this dataset are free of human impacts. One good example is Wang

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



and Hejazi, 2011.

Wang D. and M. Hejazi (2011), Quantifying the relative contribution of the climate and direct human impacts on mean annual streamflow in the contiguous United States, *Water Resources Research*, 47, W00J12, doi:10.1029/2010WR010283

[Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2017-169, 2017.](#)

## HESD

---

[Interactive  
comment](#)

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

