

Interactive comment on "The Cloud Feedback Model Intercomparison Project (CFMIP) Diagnostic Codes Catalogue – metrics, diagnostics and methodologies to evaluate, understand and improve the representation of clouds and cloud feedbacks in climate models" by Yoko Tsushima et al.

Yoko Tsushima et al.

yoko.tsushima@metoffice.gov.uk

Received and published: 28 July 2017

Thank you for your comments, which were useful to improve our repository and paper. Please see our responses below.

>To give as much information and files as possible, and to classify their diagnostics in a

C1

few categories, from the diagnostic that have all the necessary file to run a small demo to diagnostics that will require a lot of preprocessing and auxiliary material.

Thank you for your suggestion. We have now included the corresponding information in each repository. If the sample input data size exceeds the GitHub limit, either the location information is provided or it is suggested to contact the author, which is described in the Readme page for each repository. We also have created a table which summarizes the descriptions of each of the diagnostics. (Attached as a figure file)

>The list of input and output variables are missing for some diagnostics (e.g. 3.7, 3.10,...)

All diagnostic repositories were supposed to provide information about the input data required and the output variables in the Readme pages for their repositories. We apologise for the missing information for some of the diagnostics. We have now added the list of input and output variables for all diagnostics. For 3.10 the author was extremely busy, I created a folk branch, added these information to its Readme file. Pull request has been sent to the author.

>general: most of the diagnostics use monthly mean data, some of them use daily (or other frequency) data. Please provide some information.

The information is included in the new summary table.

>p. 5, line 5: the metrics also often quantify the distance with observations.

The sentence is amended as follows: '), m_i is the error in simulating the regime i, which quantifies the distance from the observations, as defined below.'

>section 3.1: MODIS data are used according to Fig 1, but are not mentioned in the Text

The following sentences have been added to the manuscript: "As a point of comparison, we also use roughly analogous observations from the MODerate resolution Imag-

ing Spectrometer (MODIS) instruments for the period March 2000 through April 2011 [Pincus et al., 2012].In Fig 1 (a), the ETCA measure between the MODIS and ISCCP climatologies is 0.47. All model differences with ISCCP exceed this value, so it is likely that errors in the climatology of total cloud amount are robustly determined."

>p. 4 l. 15: "measures of fidelity": can you say some words on it?

We have added 'closeness to the observations (fidelity)' where the word 'fidelity' appears for the first time in the manuscript.

>p. 5, l. 13: specify unit of a_i (W/m2)

It is specified as follows: "The model error (RMSE) associated with each regime i (a_i[Wm-2]) can be approximated..."

>p. 5, sect 3.2.2: this diagnostic is not available on github

There was a mistake with adding this diagnostic to the repository. The diagnostic code is now under the repository: https://github.com/tsussi/cloud-regime-error-metric/tree/master/code/

>p. 5, l. 20-24: the explanation is not clear for me.

The explanation has been modified (a figure file attached):

>sect 3.4, 3.6 and 3.7: are the ncl routines loaded at the beginning of the srcipt standard routines?

Yes, the NCL routines loaded are standard routines which are used in all scripts.

>p. 7, sect. 3.5: the matlab routines use a large number of auxiliary files

We have modified the matlab routine. The auxiliary files that are necessary give information on the model grids and on the choice of the appropriate solar zenith angle. We have added explicit information on how to obtain the auxiliary data in the Preprocessing section.

C3

>p. 7, l. 18: "and the cloud vertical distribution from CALIPSO": not on the figures, should be removed

The sentence was amended to "the histogram shows the relationship between cloud cover from CALIPSO (Winker et al., 2007) and cloud reflectance measured by PARA-SOL (Parol et al., 2004)"

>p. 12: line 9 and followings: "The too few, too bright problem." The Konsta et al., 2015 paper should also be cited here.

Following sentences have been added: "Konsta et al., (2015) confirmed this at the instantaneous time scale. The tropical low-level cloud properties are grouped in two clusters according to the observations. One cluster corresponds to cumulus-type clouds (with low cloud fraction and low cloud reflectance), while the other corresponds to stratocumulus-type clouds (with almost overcast cloud fraction and with large cloud reflectance values). However, in two versions of the LMDZ climate model (Dufresne et al., 2013, Hourdin et al., 2013a, Hourdin et al., 2013b) these properties are not reproduced. The clouds with small cloud cover have too large reflectance values and clouds with a cover close to one are overestimated.

>p. 12, l. 27: CFODDs: please expand the acronym

The acronym has been defined in earlier section 3.7 as 'Contoured Frequency by Optical Depth Diagram (CFODD)'. So we use this acronym in the later part of the manuscript.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2017-69, 2017.

Insert of the data of frequency in the data of frequency in the data of frequency in the data of the da	Diagnostics	Scientific target to	Does the code	Time	What auxiliary data
Image Image Original 1 SCP global cloud Y Preprocessing.) Origination 2 Sand Amnustolegy of cloud Y Daily 2 amounts Preprocessing.) Daily Daily 2 amounts Preprocessing.) Daily Daily 3 amounts Preprocessing.) Daily Daily 3 amounts Preprocessing. Daily Preprocessing.) Daily 3 amounts Preprocessing. Preprocessing. Daily Preprocessing.) Daily 3 amounts Preprocessing. Preprocessing. Daily Preprocessing.) Daily 4 Clanast Delos of CGM Y (post. Monthly Preprocessing done Preprocessing done Preprocessing done Preprocessing done Preprocessing done Preprocessing done Processing done Profity Preprocessing done Profity Preprocessing done Profity Preprocessing done Profity Profity Profordonthy Profory		evaluate	read CMIP data?	Frequency	is needed/
t Sicc global cloud Y Monthy A monthy a stord Annual mean y Daily anounds of cloud Y Daily anound regimes and the fermional mean of the store of the			(i.e. no preprocessing)	of Input Data	provided?
 and Amnual mean and Amnual mean and Amnual mean and Amnual mean regimes solay of cloud and regimes and order and regimes and order of the and and and and and and and and and and	Klein et al.(2013)	ISCCP global cloud amounts		Monthly	Processed Obs data/Y
And Amount mean The matcheding of cloud The matcheding of cloud and and and and and and and and and an	Williams and	Arrest mean	>	Dail.	-HO Ferrerad
aneti aneti aneti anetication of the second cycle of an activity of the second cycle of an activity and and the second cycle of an activity and and the second cycle of the second cycle of the the second cycle of the second cycle of the second cycle of the the second cycle of the second	Webb (2008),	Annual mean climatology of cloud	*	hien	Processed Ups data/Y
a et. cloud regimes al. cloud regimes t. cloud and reaction reac	Tsushima et al.(2013) annual	regimes			
 savoal scycle of etc. cloud regimes cloud row-cloud regimes cloud regimes cloud regimes cloud regimes cloud regimes cloud row-cloud reflection cloud row-cloud reflection rescliption cloud row-cloud reflection rescliption cloud row-cloud reflection rescliption rescliption	Tsushima et	Climatological	۲	Daily	Processed Obs
ai dout regimes 2) a letter regimes 2) a letter and another of CAM Y (post- red and another of CAM Y (post- red and polise of CAM Y (post- red and another of CAM Y (post- red and another of CAM Y (post- red and another of the second and another of the second and trainaction and the second another of the second and the second a	al.(2013)	seasonal cycle of			data/Y
eta Cloud datative Y Monthly d'Quaas Eerrels, cloud and reaction allors of CGM Y (post- hydrometeor Monthly d'Additione n script) N (post- hydrometeor Monthly trait cloud perges n script) N (post- hydrometeor Monthly trait cloud perges n script) N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor trait trait cloud perges n script) N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor trait frame cloud perges n script) N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor trait of ow-clouds n script) N (post- hydrometeor Monthly trait of ow-clouds n script) N (post- hydrometeor Monthly trait of ow-clouds n script) N (post- hydrometeor Monthly trait scriptions of hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor trait scriptions of hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor N (post- hydrometeor trait scriptions of hydrometeor	seasonal	cloud regimes			
All All <td>Zelinka et</td> <td>Cloud radiative</td> <td>٢</td> <td>Monthly</td> <td>Radiative Kernel /Y</td>	Zelinka et	Cloud radiative	٢	Monthly	Radiative Kernel /Y
rid deal and in script) riposes from in script) ripoda and in script) riposes doud and in script) riposes doud and in script) reaction in script) reactions reaction in script) reactions in script) reactions in script) reactions reaction in script) reactions reaction in script) reactions	17177/1P	Reliels	V (A to other	114
Function transmission In script) model In script) model et al fraction in script) et al fraction in script) tet al fraction in script) tet al fraction in script) tet al fraction in script) 2)sertical distribution processing done Monthly 2)sibledo Fourdeal processing done Monthly 2)sibledo Fourdeal in script) 6 hourly and Servicial N 6 hourly and Servicial N Monthly and Servicial	Nam and Quaas	zonal piots or שכועו מופיוים ממש	Y (post-	MONTHY	NA
fraction interaction et al interaction interaction Prestication broust N 8 hourly Prestication broust N 8 hourly Prestication broust N 8 hourly Prestication broust noscising done Monthly Stored and stratements noscising done Monthly Elst processing done Monthly Stored and stratement noscissing done Monthly Elst more stratements N 6 hourly Elst more stratements N Monthly Elst more stratements N 6 hourly Elst more stratements N Monthly Elst more stratements N Monthly et Warm rain N <td< td=""><td>(2102)</td><td>cioua ana hydrometeor</td><td>processing done in scrint)</td><td></td><td></td></td<>	(2102)	cioua ana hydrometeor	processing done in scrint)		
et al Instanteness A N B hourly train cloud property N Post: Vertical distruction Y (post: Vertical distruction Y (post: Norther of low-clouds NORTHY S) Norther of low- Distruction of the northy S) Norther of low- Northy N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N		fraction	fadine iii		
tion to load property of load property vertical distribution Y (past- 2)vertical distribution Y (past- tion SWCRE and Parasol Y (post- SIBedo refactions of low-clouds) in script) don'thly stand stand parasol Y (post- stand stand and nonthly and SST various in script) don'thly and SST various in script) don'thly for cloud stand nonthly and SST various in script) don'thly den to scales and the non-scription in script) don'thly den to scales and the time scales and the for vertices of low Y Monthly and SST various in script) don'thly don't cloud cover to EIS and SST various in the dond cover to EIS and SST various in the monthly don't bow were to EIS how Y Monthly don't bow were to EIS how y how how how how and SST various in the monthly monthly don the monthly how	Konsta et al	Instantaneous A-	z	8 hourly	N/A
of frout-cluds: of frout-cluds: processing done processing done proces	(2015)	train cloud property		Or daily	
of low-clouds processing done in script) and scription of low-clouds in scription Monthly SWCRE and Parsson V (post- SWCRE and Parsson V (post- douds monthly processing done in scription in scription of the scription of th	Nam et	Vertical distribution	Y (post-	Monthly	N/A
SW CRE and Parasol V (post- SW CRE and Parasol V (post- douds) V processing done Monthly Hourn rain in script) 6 hourly Warm rain M 6 hourly process dagams N Monthly Develoud relations time scales and the Constraint to ECS Monthly Constraint to ECS Monthly doud cover to ECS Monthly and SST ar visions and SST ar visions and SST and the Country Monthly Monthly doud cover to ECS Monthly and SST and the Country and SST and the Country and SST and the Country and SST and the Country and SST and the Country Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly Monthly	al.(2012)vertical	of low-clouds	processing done		
CRE and Parasol Y (poss: reflectance of low processing done douts of the processing done whom rain moreophysical N (hourby moreophysical N (hourby) process dagams sensitivities of low V (hour lo) and SST at valous constraint to ECS monthy to SST at valous to SST at valo	distribution		in script)		
devices of low-processing done devices and in script) of 6 hourly Warm rain Warm rain Warm rain Monthy Investigations Process diagrams process datagrams process datagrams process datagrams from exales and the constraint to ECS constraint to ECS and SST at various time scales and the constraint to ECS and SST at various and SST at various and SST and the and SST at various and SST at various at various at various at various at various at variou	Nam et	SW CRE and Parasol	Y (post-	Monthly	N/A
Marm and minimized by the second of the second seco	al.(2012)albedo	reflectance of low-	processing done		
Marm ain N 6 hourly meteophysical process diagrams A for the constraint of trapical N Monthly low-cloud reflection for the solars and the solars and the solars and the covert to EIS A Monthly cloud cover to EIS and ST a model N Monthly and ST and		ciouds	IN SCRIPT)		
process departs process departs low-cloud reflection for a statistic of the cloud court constraint to ECS constraint to	Suzuki et	Warm rain micronhusical	z	6 hourly	Processed Obs
International of the second of		process diagrams			
to SST 34 voicutor effection to SST 34 voicus time scales and the Sensitivities of bw Y Monthly doud cover to EIS and SST Lower Tropospheric Y (,,but IO Monthly Lower Tropospheric Y (,,but IO Monthly Mixing Indices	Brient and	Sensitivity of tropical	z	Monthly	Processed Obs
time scales and the rescales and the Sensitivities of low Y Monthly dout down to E15 and S57 Lower Tropospheric Y (Jbut IO Monthly Muing Indices counter on Invivement	Schneider	low-cloud reflection			data/Y
the soles and the constraint to ECS Sensitivities of low Y Monthly and SST sensitivities of low Y Monthly and SST topospheric Y (Jbut IO Monthly Lower Tropospheric Y (Jbut IO Monthly Mining Indices involved)	(2016)	to SST at various			
Sensitivities of low Y Monthly add dover to Els and SST Lower Tropospheric Y (Jbut 10 Monthly Mining Indices		time scales and the constraint to ECS			
doud cover to EIS and SST Lower Tropospheric Y (Juur IO Mixing Indices	Qu et al.(2014)	Sensitivities of low	٨	Monthly	The observational
and SST Lower Tropospheric Y (, but IO Mixing Indices routine not		cloud cover to EIS			estimates of EIS
Lower Tropospheric Y (, but IO Monthly Mixing Indices not included)		and SST			and SST slopes in
Lower Tropospheric Y (,but IO Monthly Mixing Indices routine not					the figures not included.
Mixing Indices	Sherwood et	Lower Tropospheric	Y (,but IO	Monthly	Land-sea mask/Y
	al.(2014)	Mixing Indices	routine not included)		

Fig. 1. Summary Table

C5

This scalar metric evaluates variations of climatological monthly mean net CRE over the chosen number of cloud regimes.

An error in the climatological annual variation of the CRE for regime i can be caused by an error in the amplitude of the variation and an error in the pattern (e.g. phase, shape) of the time variation. The centred RMS error of the climatological seasonal variation of the CRE for regime (s_i) relative to the observations is expressed as:

$$s_i^2 = (\sigma_{i,m} - \sigma_{i,o})^2 + 2\sigma_{i,m}\sigma_{i,o}(1 - R)$$
(3)

, where $\sigma_{i,o}$ and $\sigma_{i,m}$ denote the standard deviation of the climatological monthly mean of the observed and modelled CRE for a regime *i* from the climatological annual mean, *R* is the linear correlation coefficient between the anomaly (difference from annual mean) of the model and that of the observation over the 12 months of the seasonal cycle. We use these standard deviations as a measure of the amplitude in the seasonal variation. The error in the amplitude of the variation $(s_{i,amp})$ is defined by:

$$S_{i,amp=\sigma_{i,m}-\sigma_{i,o}} \tag{4}$$

The second term of s_i is a covariance term between the observations and the model. We define the error in the pattern of the time variation $(s_{i,cov})$ as:

$$s_{i,cov=}\sqrt{2\sigma_{i,m}\sigma_{i,o}(1-R)}$$
⁽⁵⁾

(See Tsushima et al., 2013 for details).

Fig. 2. Description of the Section 3.2.2