Interactive comment on "Error assessment of biogeochemical models by lower bound methods" by Volkmar Sauerland et al.

A. Kerkweg

kerkweg@uni-bonn.de

Dear authors,

In my role as Executive editor of GMD, I would like to bring to your attention our Editorial version 1.1:

http://www.geosci-model-dev.net/8/3487/2015/gmd-8-3487-2015.html

This highlights some requirements of papers published in GMD, which is also available on the GMD website in the 'Manuscript Types' section:

http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript_types.html

In particular, please note that for your paper, the following requirements have not been

met in the Discussions paper:

- "The main paper must give the model name and version number (or other unique identifier) in the title."

- "All papers must include a section, at the end of the paper, entitled 'Code availability'. Here, either instructions for obtaining the code, or the reasons why the code is not available should be clearly stated. It is preferred for the code to be uploaded as a supplement or to be made available at a data repository with an associated DOI (digital object identifier) for the exact model version described in the paper. Alternatively, for established models, there may be an existing means of accessing the code through a particular system. In this case, there must exist a means of permanently accessing the precise model version described in the paper. In some cases, authors may prefer to put models on their own website, or to act as a point of contact for obtaining the code. Given the impermanence of websites and email addresses, this is not encouraged, and authors should consider improving the availability with a more permanent arrangement. After the paper is accepted the model archive should be updated to include a link to the GMD paper."

Therefore it would be good, if your algorithms (the lower bound methods) could be named and versioned in the title. Additionally, to ensure that the exact version of the algorithms stays accessible, please upload them to a permanent archive providing a DOI (e.g. Zenodo) and cite this in the revised version of your article.

Yours,

Astrid Kerkweg