

Interactive comment on “Decreasing Indian summer monsoon in northern Indian sub-continent during the last 180 years: evidence from five tree cellulose oxygen isotope chronologies” by Chenxi Xu et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 2 May 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special

C1

Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

- (1) Add a "data availability" section that describes where the data can be accessed, including a Data Citation for the new data generated in this study (see below).
- (2) Add Data Citations for each of the five datasets listed in Table 1, including both the previously published data, and the new data from this study. Note that the publication citation for record #3 is incorrect; a journal issue was assigned in 2012 (not 2011; doi:10.1177/0959683611430338).
- (3) Add a note to explain that the spelling of the site name used in the previous paper is “Julma” rather than “Hulma” as it appears in the current paper.
- (4) For those data not already in a public repository, submit essential metadata along with the time series shown in Figs 2a, 3a, and 4a, plus the averaged time series (H5) in Fig 4b, and its smoothed versions (Fig 10 (red) and Fig 11b (red)).

Recommended additions:

- (1) Add Data Citations for each time series used to compare with the 18O tree-ring time series, including: Fig 5a (Indian rainfall); Fig 5b (Indian Monsoon); Fig 9 (ENSO

C2

from McGregor and Wilson); Fig 10 (Stalagmite 18O); Fig 11 (Tibetan temperature and Indian Ocean SST)

(2) Submit for archival: (a) the correlation time series in Fig 9 and (b) the land-sea thermal contrast time series in Fig 11b (black).

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2016-132/cp-2016-132-SC2-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2016-132, 2017.